

Academic Program Review (APR) Report of the Native American Studies (NAS) Program at the University of New Mexico

Prepared for Gregory Heilman, Associate Provost for Curriculum, Office of the Provost & Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs, The University of New Mexico

Prepared by Glenabah Martinez, Associate Professor in Language, Literacy and Sociocultural Studies at the University of New Mexico and Cornel Pewewardy, Professor and Director of Indigenous Nations Studies at Portland State University

Date prepared is December 22, 2014

1. 0 Introduction

This is a report of the academic program review of the NAS Program at the University of New Mexico. It has been conducted in accordance with the *Academic Program Review Policies, Principles and Guidelines* manual <http://apr.unm.edu/common/docs/apr-policies-and-preccedures-manual.pdf>.

2.0 Purpose of the Review

The purpose of this report is to provide commentary on the strengths and weaknesses of the program, offer advice to enhance its quality, and comment upon its academic objectives and directions in the context of the wider objectives of the University College and the University as a whole. This is the second program review since the inception of the NAS program in 2005.

3.0 Review Committee Members

The Review Committee consisted of the following members: Glenabah Martinez, Associate Professor in Language, Literacy and Sociocultural Studies at the University of New Mexico; Myla Vicenti Carpio, Associate Professor in American Indian Studies at Arizona State University; and Cornel Pewewardy, Professor and Director of Indigenous Nations Studies at Portland State University. Myla Vicenti Carpio was absent from the site visit because of a death in the family.

4.0 Review Process

The review process consisted of an on-site visit on November 3-4, 2014. The on-site visit consisted of meetings with NAS faculty and senior administrators of the University College and the University. The Committee met with a group of students on the second day. Staff of NAS were interviewed separately from the faculty, and a list of staff members interviewed is included in Appendix 1.

5.0 Mainstream Universities and Indigenous Peoples

Over the last three decades, Native American leaders have advocated for academic programs at all levels that respond to a wide variety of Indigenous needs, tribal self-government among them. University responses resulted in the development of undergraduate and graduate programs. The academic culture that has evolved has several distinct features that are now considered standard for NAS programs:

- Bicultural/multiple epistemic academic culture rooted in both western academic knowledge and the emerging field of Indigenous knowledge, formerly called cultural knowledge,
- Formal relationships with local Indigenous communities expressed through mechanisms such as advisory councils, student work placements, and a preference for community-based research,
- Culturally responsive curricula and university sponsored workshops, seminars, and conferences that center Indigenous languages and cultures, and
- Holistic learning environments designed from Indigenous worldviews.

Faculty are expected to serve as facilitators of intercultural dialogues, helping to lead the way in fostering an improved campus climate of respect for Indigenous peoples within universities and society in general. University facilities are expected to include student gathering spaces, student workspaces, and facilities for Indigenous activities such as powwows, feasts, Elders and traditional person's workshops, spiritual ceremonies, and community engagement.

The University is expected to foster communities of scholars, students, and local community members coming together in a common intellectual project. This idea of community and its expression in organizational climate and culturally responsive practices is foundational to Indigenous programming.

NAS programs are also sites of interdisciplinary study that bring together scholars from a wide variety of social science disciplines (anthropology, sociology, political studies, economics, teacher education, business administration) and more recently humanities (history, cultural studies, women's studies, American studies, English literature). This core of scholars provides both theoretical and applied programs of study, prepared usually in consultation with local tribal communities in order to meet some of their needs for trained personnel. More recently, Indigenous knowledge has awakened the academy to living sovereignty through Elders speaking in NAS classrooms, hosting post-doctoral fellows, teaching as visiting scholars, and holding lecturer and tenured faculty positions.

The UNM-NAS program is clearly situated within this emergent model of Indigenous academic programming. As an undergraduate program, it has fostered the development of a rigorous intellectual climate that is strongly connected to local tribal communities within the state of New Mexico.

6.0 The Native American Studies Program

The concept of the NAS Program was established at UNM on July 1, 1970, as a result of the efforts of the UNM Kiva Club (a student organization), several UNM staff, and community members. The minor in NAS was established in 1999. The major in NAS was approved by the UNM Board of Regents for the 2004-2005 academic year.

NAS is an interdisciplinary program, and the course of study focuses on the richness of American Indian cultures, examines the nature of historic and contemporary issues, and prepares students to engage in careers and service to American Indian communities. There are two curricular content areas in the NAS program: (1) Indigenous Leadership, Self-Determination,

and Building Sustainable Communities; and (2) Indigenous Language, Education, and Learning Communities.¹

The mission of NAS is to provide a quality interdisciplinary baccalaureate degree and minor degree with particular emphasis on keeping current with the growing twenty-first century movements in Indigenous knowledge developments locally and globally. To realize this mission, courses and other learning activities employing both University and community-based teaching and learning content and methodology are implemented. Through this process students have the opportunity to develop a 'critical consciousness' about their lives as Native Americans while becoming active participants in strategies to help resolve socio-economic challenges in their communities of origin and the world at-large.²

This mission is advanced by a small group of five outstanding faculty and three excellent staff. Currently, there is a Program Director with a 2/3 appointment in Education and 1/3 in the University College; two full appointments as Associate Professors; one joint-appointment as Associate Professor; one joint-appointment as Assistant Professor; and one full time Lecturer II. There is also one full time program coordinator, one full time administrative assistant, and one shared Senior Academic Advisor with the University Advising Center.

The five tenure-track faculty members (Gregory Cajete, Tiffany Lee, Lloyd Lee, Robin Minthorn and Beverly Singer) are highlighted below:

Gregory Cajete is the perennial Indigenous scholar within the Indigenous science educational discourse whose seven books have secured him an international reputation as the leading Indigenous scholar in his field.

Tiffany Lee was appointed Associate Director of NAS in 2012 and continues to serve in leadership roles as the President of the Navajo Studies Conference, Inc. Board of Directors as well as serving on national boards and committees like the Indigenous Peoples of the America's Special Interest Group within the American Educational Research Association.

Lloyd Lee is active with the Institute for American Indian Research by hosting the annual Navajo Studies Conference, being appointed to the selection committees for the Udall Scholarship and Excellence in Nation Environmental Policy Foundation, and continuing book reviews for the *American Indian Quarterly*.

Beverly Singer has a scholarly focus on Indigenous film, video and community wellness. She was appointed Senior Fellow for the New Mexico Cares Health Disparities Center in 2013. In 2010, she became the Director of the Alfonzo Ortiz Center for Intercultural Studies, a program of public anthropology and community engagement.

Robin Minthorn was elected to the 2014 national board of the National Indian Education Association. She published a book chapter in the 2013 *Beyond the Asterisk: Native American Students in Higher Education* and has a forthcoming publication this year as co-editor of a book with Alicia Fedelina Chavez titled *Indigenous Leadership in Higher Education*.

All NAS faculty are excellent teachers and researchers engaged in critical and culturally responsive pedagogy.

The pedagogical and curricular model supports the NAS mission. The pedagogical approach consists of intellectually and emotionally challenging undergraduate courses that critically examine Western and Indigenous political and social thought and action. Indigenous issues are discussed in both a global and local context that enables students to see the links between the two geopolitical sites.

There is an increased interest in NAS courses with enrollment growing from only seven minors during the 2001-2002 academic year to over 155 majors and minors for the 2013-2014 academic year. The NAS – BA program has produced over 165 graduates (majors and minors) since the degree was approved in 2005. It is anticipated that the size of the graduating classes will continue to increase. The NAS program currently offers on average 20 courses per semester (including cross-listed courses) serving approximately 200-300 students per year.³

The NAS faculty has developed a proposal for a Master's Degree in Native American Studies with an emphasis in Indigenous Leadership, Self-Determination, and Sustainable Community Building. This graduate proposal plans to be submitted to the Office of the Provost this Fall 2014. This degree will be unique among tier one Universities in the U.S. in that its emphasis will be on community-based education for Indigenous leadership and community building. The NAS Master's degree will form a foundation for an equally unique Ph.D. degree proposal in Indigenous Sustainable Community Based Leadership in the future.⁴

A community-based education for Indigenous leadership and community building approach provides an opportunity for students to work with local Indigenous communities on issues directly related to their own governance struggles. This project reinforces the link between theory and practice as well as providing valuable practical experience. The NAS program is currently located in the UNM – University College. The NAS Director, Gregory Cajete, reports directly to the Dean of the University College, Kate Krause. The Associate Director of NAS is Tiffany Lee.

7.0 Findings

We've organized the report into a set of general findings and then a list of specific findings with recommendations. It is important to provide an overview of the Program, its mission and aspirations. This is the foundation for future development.

General

The NAS program is a high quality Indigenous-centered undergraduate program with immediate plans to create a Master's Degree with an emphasis on Indigenous Leadership. Its faculty members are outstanding scholars with exceptional records of teaching, research, and service. The students are highly motivated and well-prepared for future study or work in a wide variety of situations.

The NAS program is relatively small consisting of five tenure-track faculty members, evenly split between new, medium and long-term faculty. None are expected to retire within the next

decade. The research and publication records of the faculty are outstanding. The teaching of faculty, as expressed in student reviews, is similarly excellent. The engaged pedagogical and curricular model is innovative and remains at the leading edge of Indigenous undergraduate education.

The scope and sequence of courses required for the major and minor in Native American Studies are clearly stated in the report. Major components of the syllabi are organized with careful detail to primary and secondary sources, pedagogical exercises, and assessments. The curricular contributions of NAS are significant because a majority of their courses meet the U.S. and Global Diversity and Inclusion requirement that the Provost's Office has created for all undergraduate programs of study. In addition, a substantial number of courses are cross-listed with two major departments in the College of Education. The program has cultivated a positive working relationship with American Studies, Chicano/a Studies, Linguistics, and Fine Arts (Music). The NAS program has engaged in multiple forms of extracurricular activities that meet their overall goals and objectives. The program supports collaborative outreach initiatives such as the College for Social Transformation, the Student Leadership Outreach Conference, and the Institute for American Indian Research. All of these activities meet at least one of the NAS Program's Student Learning Outcomes (SLO's).

While the NAS faculty is small as compared to peer institutions across the country, each faculty member demonstrates an extremely high commitment to the program, students, University, and their own academic careers. All described the rewarding nature of their work within the University and the contribution that they are making to capture a comprehensive picture of what's wrong and what might be done. All faculty members are fully engaged in culturally responsive pedagogy, a premise built on close interactions among ethnic identity, cultural background and student achievement, which is a core element of the NAS program. Tenured program members teach all core courses; there is a deep pool of adjunct instructors (contract faculty) to back-fill courses as needed or when necessary.

The students show a high level of commitment and engagement with the department and are excited, energized, and academically challenged by their NAS studies. They report that they are generally very satisfied with their program of studies while indicating areas that they would like to see strengthened. Student interviewed respect and speak very highly of the NAS faculty and program staff and the support that they provide. Hiring graduates of the program for short-term projects and staff positions has been seen as positive. See Appendix 2 for transcribed student responses.

A post-doctoral fellow at UNM offered supportive comments about the NAS program. Being an Indigenous person from the Kichwa nation in Ecuador, the post-doctoral fellow gave moral and academic support to many students in NAS. The post-doctoral fellow helped NAS to develop and sign an MOU with an Indigenous university from Peru in South America and is currently in the process of establishing new MOUs with Mexico and Ecuador.

Incorporating Native culture in student affairs is very important and necessary because as students continue to experiment, grow, and learn, they must have the capacity to carry with them what is most essential, their cultural identity. American Indian Student Services and NAS faculty

have similar, yet distinct charges to support the success of Native American students at UNM. It is critical that both programs collaborate together in ways that offer opportunities for the campus community and local Native community to maintain ties and develop mutual support. There appears to be a large barrier within campus strategies to recruitment and retention of Native American students at UNM. To establish a stronger connection with Native American students, NAS and American Indian Student Services need to work in concert with each other's programs on campus.

The NAS Program is committed to recruiting students from other institutions as transfer students and to incoming freshmen. At the time of the review, 80% of NAS students transferred from the branch campuses of UNM and other institutions across the nation. Freshmen and transfer students begin their UNM main campus journey in the University College (UC). An advisor and faculty in NAS provides advising for students who are interested in or have committed to pursuing a minor or major in NAS. A program coordinator in NAS is charged with recruitment among other duties. This individual maintains a consistent presence at recruitment fairs, high schools, and school districts. The policies for NAS admission are clearly outlined in the report. In addition to the advising that is available to NAS students described above, NAS provides student support services, which includes technical support for scholarships such as how to apply for scholarships and informing students about opportunities for funding of educational pursuits including research, attending conferences, and tuition, and a site for student organization meetings (NASIRG, Dine Club, Kiva Club, SNAGS, and ISDCC). The efficacy of these initiatives is in their graduation rates and retention numbers. A plan is currently being created by the NAS program coordinator, Mateo Sanchez, in charge of advisement and recruitment. Mateo Sanchez has developed a plan for recruitment at high schools in the state of New Mexico and for retaining students at UNM.

The program facilities consist of faculty offices, staff offices, a common gathering area, and a meeting area that can be made private for use for seminars or faculty meetings. Additional facilities are available within American Indian Student Services, a short distance away in the same building as NAS.

Starting its second decade, the NAS program finds itself, like many others (NAS), at a crossroads in its existence. It has reached its capacity for program growth in its current configuration of undergraduate faculty, staff, and students. The NAS program faces a current decision whether to grow or remain at its current size. As mentioned previously, the NAS faculty has plans to submit their graduate proposal to the Office of the Provost this Fall 2014. Too, the Master's degree in NAS will form the foundation for a future Ph.D. degree in Indigenous Sustainable Community Based Leadership.

The NAS program attracts attention from Native scholars across North America because of the geographic location of the University, geographic proximity to 22 Native Nations in New Mexico, and, most importantly, for the academic excellence of the program itself. However, with the limited budget for tenure-track faculty lines and without the economic support to build upon the current infrastructure and sustain a future graduate program in NAS, the program cannot realize its potential and long-range goals. The NAS program has operated successfully with limited structural resources due to the commitment of the program's faculty and staff. The

expectations of their students, Native Nations, and communities are adequately met, but this is largely due to NAS faculty and staff working together to create culturally unique spaces on the UNM campus. Overall, students in the NAS program are receiving a solid education. There is concern, however, that due to the absence of a graduate program in NAS they are forced to leave the state to attend universities in Arizona, Oklahoma, Montana, and California (UCLA and UC Davis). Leaving the state for many of the Native students is also leaving their cultural responsibilities in the Navajo Nation, the nineteen Pueblo Nations, and the two Apache Nations. For many of the Native students interviewed, incorporating Native culture into both student support services and academic pedagogy was crucial to their survival as tribal people. Therefore, the thought of leaving the state of New Mexico in pursuit of graduate studies was important because many of the Native students we interviewed placed high value on their tribal spirituality. Accordingly, the thought of having to leave the state was not an option. Some students said that they would not pursue graduate studies outside of UNM, but would rather select a graduate program close to their tribal homelands.

Many students on the UNM campus see the NAS program as a culturally unique and safe space on campus where Native-centered programming is allowed for the building of a “new” narrative into institutions of higher education. Faculty and staff would also like to be able to support better their existing community partnerships and expand them to provide more opportunity for students. The issue of institutional leadership (UNM higher education administration) into the second decade has also been raised as a systemic issue and institutional challenge to be addressed immediately.

8.0 Specific Findings and Recommendations

1. The program faces a choice of whether to pursue growth or to remain at its current size.
2. Remaining at its current size means that the program remains relatively small and is more easily able to remain true to its original vision. It would remain a small, high quality, intellectually challenging and community-based Indigenous undergraduate program. Faculty complement would remain at its current size or grow from its current 5 to 6. A full-fledged PhD program in NAS, offered by the faculty members, would not be possible as there would not be the required tenure-track faculty members (at least 6, preferably 8). It may be possible to assemble the required tenure-track faculty through strategic collaborations and partnerships with existing campus and international partners such as universities in New Zealand.
3. Pursuing a growth strategy would require the program to decide whether to pursue program status within the University College or develop a “stand alone” program built upon an Indigenous paradigm. The decision to pursue a department status requires that the program also pursue the development of both an undergraduate and graduate program. It would be necessary to initiate a study to determine if there is sufficient demand for a graduate program in NAS as well as start discussions with other academic units to be able to offer sufficient courses for such programs.
4. At its current size, the program faculty complement at five is lean for the course and supervisory workload expected of them. Given the high demands for maintaining community-based projects and the mentorship model of their curricular holistic approach, there seems to be

less than five (5) FTE faculty assigned to NAS as its current status. Additional faculty (NAS as their tenure home) should be added to elicit effective collegial support. Students have expressed a strong desire for Native American faculty and the hiring committee should engage its best efforts to find a culturally responsive faculty to fulfill their next academic hire(s). The program might also consider the possibility of joint appointments or cluster hires as a way of enhancing the complement and widening the intellectual experience of students.

5. The program provides an outstanding foundation in critical Indigenous thought for students. Students are exposed to Indigenous knowledge through their community work, which is often undertaken under the supervision of local Elders and traditional people as well as activists and community leaders. It would enhance student learning if Elders and traditional people were more present in the UNM campus aspects of the program through programs such as Elders in Residence, Elder co-instruction for some courses and traditional teaching workshops.

6. While sufficient demand for the NAS program exists, as evidenced by program applications, this demand can fluctuate from year to year and be influenced by the package of support that is available to prospective students. Perhaps a memorandum of understanding between the NAS program and American Indian Student Services can formalize working agreements between these two groups whose basis charge is to recruit and retain Native American students at UNM, thereby providing boundaries of operation between the two groups on campus. It would also be useful for the programs to continue to sponsor workshops for students to assist them in preparing applications for tribal scholarships and grants. These activities, well regarded in the past, could become a regular part of the mentorship activities for both programs.

7. The cohort model is a strength used by many peer NAS programs across the country and should be considered. It provides much needed social and academic support for students as well as providing excellent opportunities for improving cross-cultural dialogue skills, conflict resolution, and improved interpersonal knowledge and skills. The program should also ensure that it maintain a good balance of Indigenous-non-Indigenous students, focusing on ensuring that the majority of students in the program are of Indigenous heritage and origin, consistent with its mission to train Indigenous leaders.

8. While the NAS program governance structure and process is functioning adequately, it would be helpful to clarify the roles of faculty and staff in decision-making especially around the issue of academic programming, workload, and assignments. A formal description of the program committee's structure, mandate, and decision-making process would enhance operations.

9. While faculty are highly productive producing work of high quality, consistent with other units within UNM, the program should develop its own standards of faculty expectations and duties, particularly around the duties and campus presence of the program Director. Given the mentorship model of instruction, it is especially important to establish norms relating to the time spent on campus in addition to electronic availability (Skype and email). Face-to-Face regular interaction is a key success factor engaged pedagogy for the program.

10. The academic experience of students can be enhanced through their exposure to a diversity of viewpoints and scholarship not available now through the small group of NAS faculty and the

practice of not hiring contract faculty. The Program should examine strategic collaborations with other academic units on campus: Health, Public Administration, Indian Law, American Studies, Social Work, School of Education, Urban Planning, among others.

11. There is, perhaps not unreasonably, a perception that this program, conceived, lobbied for, and built by Gregory Cajete is his program. Professor Cajete has provided leadership since 2002 when he assumed the role as the Director of Native American Studies. Since 2002, substantial gains have been made in the delivery of an excellent academic program. He has recruited faculty and staff to maintain a strong infrastructure. The program should consider the development of a succession plan to ensure that the program has the resources to continue and that there is continuation to function at a high level if and when Professor Cajete chooses to retire or reduce his involvement. UNM Administration recognizes the strengths of the NAS program as do the students. Most are aware of the strength of scholarship that is produced by NAS faculty. Students recognized the strength of the program for Indigenous Nations across the state and the nation. NAS faculty also acknowledge the importance of their scholarship, service, and teaching. At the same time, NAS faculty recognizes their challenges. A major challenge is human resource capacity followed by the need for economic support. Administrators are aware of these challenges. The challenges are immediate and important to acknowledge and act upon.

12. The current economic upheaval has contributed to an increase in social turbulence that must be factored in by college students preparing for professional careers in American society. Therefore, this APR report provides UNM higher administration the opportunity to reflect on and provide supportive options for the NAS program, particularly because there are structural impediments to funding in these financial troubling times. Accordingly, reframing and strengthening the NAS program profile requires UNM higher education administration to better understand and use multiple perspectives.

Based on our findings, UNM higher education administration should reallocate structural and financial resources to the current NAS program. Structurally so unique in higher education institutions, the NAS program at UNM represents the voices of the first generation of global Indigenous scholars and converges those voices, their analyses, and their dreams of a decolonized world. We want this APR report to lay the groundwork for a new generation of NAS master's degree graduates (guided by additional tenure-track faculty) and future tribal leader who recognize the importance of providing new diverse frameworks for understanding how and why colonization has been so pervasive and tenacious among Indigenous peoples as well as help students cultivate a tribal critical thinking development process. By reinvesting more financial and structural resources to the current NAS program will ultimately support their immediate and long-range goals. We base this support and growth on the premise that the NAS program already has a highly robust undergraduate major, motivated diverse students, productive and exemplary faculty, and skilled workforce is a powerful competitive national advantage for UNM and the state of New Mexico.

Notes:

- 1 Paragraph is drawn from page 1 in the executive summary of the NAS APR Report.
- 2 Paragraph is drawn from page 1 in the executive summary of the NAS APR Report.
- 3 Paragraph is drawn from page 1 in the executive summary of the NAS APR Report.
- 4 Paragraph is drawn from page 2 in the executive summary of the NAS APR Report.

Appendix 1 List of Persons Interviewed

NAS Faculty

Gregory Cajete	Director & Associate Professor of Native American Studies
Tiffany Lee	Associate Professor of Native American Studies
Beverly Singer	Associate Professor of Anthropology & Native American Studies
Lloyd Lee	Associate Professor of Native American Studies
Robin Minthorn	Assistant Professor of Native American Studies
Geneva Becenti	Teaching Assistant in Native American Studies

NAS Staff

Mateo L. Sanchez	Program Coordinator in Native American Studies
Delia Halona	Administrative Assistant III

NAS Affiliated Faculty/Staff

Shawn L. Secatero	Assistant Professor, Teacher Education, Educational Leadership & Policy
Yolanda Teran	Post-Doctoral Fellow
Paulita Aguilar	Associate Professor, University Libraries

UNM Administration

Provost Abdallah	Provost of UNM
Gregory L. Heileman	Associate Provost for Curriculum
Kate Krause	Dean of University College, Dean of Honors College
Jozi De Leon	Vice President for Equity & Inclusion, Chief Diversity Officer

UNM Support Programs

Pamela Agoyo	Director & Special Assistant to the President, American Indian Student Services
--------------	---

Katrina Sweetland Program Coordinator, American Indian Student Services

Margaret Lumpmouth Senior Academic Advisor UAC

Irene E. Vasquez Director, Chicano Hispano Mexicano Studies

Students

Seventeen (17) current students were interviewed during a NAS class meeting on the second day of the site visit. Names were not recorded.

Appendix 2: Transcribed Student Responses

NAS is about reflecting Native American science. We learn in a circular way taught by Native professors.

I enjoyed being introduced to Native authors, especially the book by Cordova because after reading chapters we have in-depth discussion. That book is great.

As an older student, we discuss many contemporary issues that happened back in my day. The basic lesson is that if you don't follow the rules, you will be punished.

I would like to see more practice on resistance discourse.

I wish we had a 4th year master's program in NAS. I would hate to leave this area.

From introductory classes to where I am now, each class in NAS makes us reflect. The teachers are familiar with the medicine wheel and its concepts.

We go from subjective to objective learning.

Last summer, I took a two-week community based learning course in NAS and I learned quite a lot. We learned about Indigenous peoples and the homeless.

NAS doesn't address the social climate like GMOs; essence of time and space; doesn't address resolving current issues.

I am not so sure about NAS courses taught by non-Indians. I could tell the difference when Native teachers teach the courses than non-Natives. For example, when Dr. Cajete comes into the classroom to teach his courses, I don't want to leave. I don't get that feeling from non-Native teaching here at UNM. With non-Natives, it's like watching a TED Talk because there is no interaction with the students. I want a teacher to answer my questions. Just because a teacher has a Ph.D., doesn't give them the license to teach. I don't get my monies worth.

Here at UNM, there seems to be more emphasis on the graduate students. There needs to be just as much focus on undergraduate students. Teacher need to create a friendly climate in the classroom.

Stories are great metaphors.

NAS has an Indigenous perspective toward research (Indigenous ways of knowing).

Small issues like fishing, I don't hear much about this topic.

Some instructors don't or can't teach. This particular teacher can't teach. For example, as a student I need an outline for what is expected. We are not told how to do journaling. Half the class was upset with the teacher. When you email the teacher, you get no response.

I wish NAS would teach all the Native languages, not just Dine or Tewa.

From NAS courses, I transfer my learning with my mother.

Learning tribal languages is a challenge. I don't speak my tribal language. I would like more encouragement and strategies for learning how to speak your tribal language.

There is sense of kinship in these courses and they help us get through our studies. In my way, I get up early in the morning and pray to the east because that's how I was taught. Taking classes in NAS has taken my clouds away. Its all about taking your education back into your tribal community.

As an older student, younger students interpret the world by their life experience, the human affect. Its more valuable to me than a BA. It does a lot for you. For example, the politics of identity discussion the teacher asked "what makes a Zuni and Zuni? Personal growth comes from NAS.

I find language valuable to ceremony, but I need to go further and learn more.

The younger generation doesn't know more about ways of knowing.

I admire the validity of tradition. I grew up honoring every cultural taboo. I admire NAS and respect the program for its traditions and culture.

I find it comfortable that I can carry over my learning from NAS to other disciplines like Anthropology. There in Anthropology we are seen as extinct.

NAS is opens up to more non-Native students and not seen as a subject to be studied.

Some of us don't have an option to more physically move out of Albuquerque. It hurts me to think that I will have to move out of town out of state to continue my studies in NAS. I don't have 10 years to get into another academic program.

Here at NAS, the graduate school orientation was too late.

I always ask the question "do you have the master's degree set up in NAS?" I think they are in the talking stage of their master's program.

I don't feel good about getting a NAS degree and then going elsewhere to further my NAS advance studies.

NAS is a foundational add-on to a western degree and the professional world.

NAS has given me a more humane way to look at things. For example Indigenous research methods vs. scientific ways.

I would enjoy these classes more if they had more critical discussions. Take the ideas and move them into more critical perspectives.

Some professors say “well you can do that on your own.” “You can do that on your own.” We get vilified by the NAS faculty.

We could use a NAS metaphysics class here.

We have two programs: NAS and AISS. What’s up with that?

I was really upset with the Zuni governor for endorsing the Washington Redskins. “Its going to fall on deaf ears.”

We gave away blankets to the homeless.

Some students when they hear thunder, they throw their hands up in the air.

APPENDIX F

ACADEMIC PROGRAM REVIEW TEAM WORKSHEET

This worksheet should be used to document any department/program shortcomings relative to the UNM Criteria for Program Review. For each criterion, please note whether shortcomings exist in the criterion. If a shortcoming is identified, please note it as Met, Met With Concerns (MC), Marginally Met (MM), or Not Met (NM), (refer to manual –page 8 - for descriptions). For any shortcomings, please summarize the basis for your conclusion in the appropriate box. If a potential shortcoming changes in level or is resolved during the campus visit, provide an explanation for how it was resolved or changed.

Visit Dates: November 3, 4, 2014

Department/
Program: Native American Studies Evaluator(s): Dr. Cornel Pewewardy
Dr. Glenabah Martinez

Criterion	Assessment (MC/MM/NM)	Comments
1. PROGRAM GOALS		
Published goals/educational objectives for each program (undergraduate and graduate)	Meets	The Native American Studies Program (NAS) developed an extensive framework of program goals with measurable objectives to achieve them. The overview provided a historical context for situating the student learning objectives (SLOs) for the undergraduate program.
Consistent with mission (UNM’s and unit’s) and the needs of constituents	Meets	The unit’s primary constituents and stakeholders (students, NM Native Nations, and Indigenous leadership) are central to the goals and objectives through courses, program literature, program media, and personal interactions.
Students are aware of program goals	Meets	Current students and alumni are keenly aware of program goals. Undergraduate students were able to identify specific components of the curriculum that demonstrated knowledge of the program’s mission and goals.
2. TEACHING AND LEARNING: CURRICULUM		

<p>For each program, adequate coverage of program-appropriate curricular components, and consistent with the learning goals of the program/university</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The scope and sequence of courses required for the major and minor in Native American Studies were clearly stated in the report. Major components of the syllabi are organized with careful detail to primary and secondary sources, pedagogical exercises, and assessments.</p>
<p>Contributions to other units are adequately coordinated (with other units) and appropriate for the offering unit</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The curricular contributions of NAS are significant because a majority of their courses meet the Diversity requirement that the Provost's Office has created for all undergraduate programs of study. In addition, a substantial number of courses are cross-listed with two major departments in the College of Education. The program has cultivated a positive working relationship with American Studies, Chicano/a Studies, Linguistics, and Fine Arts (Music).</p>
<p>Extracurricular programs/activities are sufficient and consistent with program goals/educational objectives</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The NAS program has engaged in multiple forms of extracurricular activities that meet the goals and objectives. The program supports collaborative outreach initiatives such as the College for Social Transformation, the Student Leadership Outreach Conference, and the Institute for American Indian Research. All of these activities meet at least one of the NAS Program's SLO's.</p>
<p>Program delivery modes are of sufficient quality and address student needs</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The faculty and staff of NAS excel in delivering high quality programs that address student needs. Lectures delivered by nationally recognized Indigenous scholars on a regular basis. In addition, NAS sponsors and supports two major student organizations: The Kiva Club and the Native American Studies Indigenous Research Group.</p>
<p>3. TEACHING AND LEARNING: CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT</p>		

<p>Regular use of appropriate, documented processes for assessing and evaluating the extent to which the program educational objectives are being attained</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The assessments were both formative and summative and evaluated the knowledge base and skills from lower to higher order levels of cognition. The assessments and other forms of course evaluation provided a means for faculty regardless of level and years of experience to gain awareness of teaching effectiveness.</p>
<p>Regular use of appropriate evaluation tools for assessing teaching effectiveness</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>Humanities competencies and SLOs Assessment in the core curriculum are excellent. Six competencies are identified with a minimum of one formative and/or summative assessment. Reflection writing exercises, critical reviews, interviews, book talks, and examinations are the major forms of assessment. The assessments are designed to not only evaluate and assess student acquisition of skills and knowledge, but they also serve to assess the pedagogical effectiveness.</p>
<p>Results of evaluations systematically utilized as input for the continuous improvement of programs</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The NAS Program provides detailed explanations of an assessment of student learning via a three-year plan. The plan measures knowledge, skills, responsibility, and how the Program SLO is conceptually different from university goals. For each SLO, the Program identifies and implements a direct measure of the SLO. An essential part of the plan is for all NAS faculty to convene at the end of each academic year to review and evaluate the efficacy of pedagogy in meeting the SLO's. Recommendations for improvement are shared with faculty and students.</p>

4. STUDENTS		
<p>Policies for accepting new and transfer students (including transfer credits) are in place and are enforced</p>	<p>Meets With Concerns</p>	<p>The NAS Program is committed to recruiting students from other institutions as transfer students and incoming freshmen. At the time of the review, 80% of NAS students transferred from the branch campuses of UNM and other institutions across the nation. Freshmen and transfer students begin their UNM main campus journey in University College (UC). An advisor and faculty in NAS provide advisement for students who are interested or have committed to pursuing a minor or major in NAS. A program coordinator in NAS is charged with recruitment among other duties. This individual maintains a consistent presence at recruitment fairs, high schools, and school districts. The policies for NAS admission is clearly outlined in the report.</p>
<p>Student performance and progress are adequately monitored</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>In addition to receiving services from the UC advisement center and course/credit monitoring services, NAS students work closely with NAS faculty and staff for graduation advisement.</p>
<p>All students receive adequate and appropriate advisement and referral to student support services</p>	<p>Meets with concerns</p>	<p>NAS majors and minors are provided with extensive services and support in meeting their academic goals. A core group of individuals including NAS staff and faculty, one University Advisement Center Senior Academic Advisor, and the University Advisement director work together in providing advisement services. Students are referred to student support services. However, it should be noted that in the interviews with NAS students, some questioned a disconnect between NAS and American Indian Student Services (AISS). One student questioned the hesitancy by NAS staff and faculty in referring students to AISS for student support.</p>

<p>Student success and retention initiatives are appropriate for the unit and evaluated for effectiveness</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>In addition to the advisement that is available to NAS students described above, NAS provides student support services which include financial support for scholarships, a site for student organization meetings (NASIRG, Dine Club, Kiva Club, SNAGS, and ISDCC). The efficacy of these initiatives is in their graduation rates and retention numbers. A plan is currently being created by the NAS program coordinator in charge of advisement and recruitment.</p>
<p>The success of graduates is tracked and assessed</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The program is working on documenting the success of graduates. The report provided details on five NAS alumni that was collected at the 13th Annual Viola Cordova Symposium in 2013. All of them are employed or pursuing graduate studies in fields directly related to Indigenous Peoples. Given the budgetary limitations of the program, UNM could support efforts by NAS to track and assess NAS graduates with funding to create a data base. This would afford both quantitative and qualitative data for the program to draw on for future curricular decisions and programming projects.</p>

5. FACULTY		
Sufficient number and competencies to cover all program and curricular areas	Meets With Concerns	It is clear from the review of the report discussions with NAS faculty, UNM administration, and students that there is concern regarding the number of faculty in NAS to sustain this important program. NAS course instruction is currently provided by full-time, joint, and adjunct faculty. Given the small number of NAS faculty, there is concern by all parties mentioned above about the ability of the program to provide all of the courses necessary for students to complete their studies in NAS. If one full-time faculty member takes a sabbatical, then there is a need to find coverage for two to three courses per semester. Joint appointed faculty are important in providing courses in NAS, but they are overworked due to their teaching, research, and service responsibilities in two departments. This is the concern. UNM needs to provide NAS with tenure-tracked faculty lines in order to sustain the integrity of the academic programs.
Appropriate qualifications	Meets	All of the tenure-track faculty which includes assistant and associate level professors are well-qualified. A review of their CVs will demonstrate a strong foundation in the social sciences and Native American Studies. All faculty are published in peer-reviewed journals along with book publications. They serve on international national, state and local committees. At the university level, their contributions are outstanding.
Adequate levels of research and creative activities	Meets	All of the tenure-track faculty are engaged in field-based and conceptual research projects. In addition faculty engage in scholarship that include film production and the fine arts.

<p>Adequate levels of student-faculty interaction, student advising and counseling</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>Although the faculty in NAS is small compared to other units across UNM, the faculty make important contributions to students who are majoring and minoring in NAS. They also value students who are not pursuing a major or minor, but who are taking courses in NAS. The interaction between faculty and students is phenomenal. In addition, faculty serve on MA/MS and Ph.D. committees (comprehensive examination and dissertation). Their participation in this capacity is excellent.</p>
<p>Adequate levels of university/professional service activities</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The entire NAS faculty is engaged in projects, committees, and other activities across UNM. They serve on university wide committees such as the Provost's Committee on Diversity, the Promotion and Tenure committee, and other faculty-based committees. Given the unique nature of NAS, faculty are routinely asked to serve as consultants (usually pro bono) to Indigenous Nations across New Mexico and the nation. The NAS faculty is recognized for their expertise in leadership, governance/sovereignty, education, and media arts so it is not surprising that they are called upon to provide professional development and other services for the Indigenous Nations.</p>

<p>Adequate levels of professional development</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>All of the faculty find ways to gain professional development to enhance their pedagogical skills, content, and scholarship. They attend conferences such as the American Educational Research Association (AERA), the Native American Indigenous Studies Association (NAISA), and the Western Sciences Association (WSA) to present their research and to learn from their colleagues. In addition, faculty participates in workshops sponsored by UNM. Again, given the tremendous workload of the NAS faculty, it is amazing that they find ways to participate in professional development.</p>
--	--------------	--

6. RESOURCES AND PLANNING		
Unit engages in resource planning and allocation, possibly with use of external advisory board	Meets With Concerns	At the present time NAS does not have an external advisory board, but NAS does have a well-organized plan in place for resource allocation and planning. Funding is provided by the Dean of the University College and the UNM Foundation. Money from the UNM Foundation is used for scholarships. A committee comprised of NAS faculty make the selections.
The unit has sufficient resources and institutional support to carry out its mission	Meets with concerns	The NAS program does not receive adequate funding to provide educational/academic services to their students. With the exception of two full-time Associate Professors, all other faculty are joint appointments meaning that their salaries are shared in two departments. As stated earlier in this report, this is difficult for faculty who hold responsibilities in two different departments. In addition, in 2010-2011, NAS had no budget for program development.
Staff composition and deployment is adequate	Meets	NAS staff consists of one full-time administrative assistant and a program director in charge of recruitment and advising. Student employees also provide services along with one teaching assistant.
Unit solicits and receives appropriate levels of external support	Meets with concerns	There are concerns regarding support for the NAS library. More information about the relationship between NAS and Zimmerman Library is needed. The relationship between NAS and other entities of UNM were not fully described in the report.

7. FACILITIES		
Facilities are adequate to support student learning, along with scholarly and research activities	Meets with Concerns	One classroom is available for NAS classes. The room is small and capacity is probably at 20 adults. A library is available with access to books, audiovisual, and periodicals. Additional space for one more classroom would be helpful.
Office space for faculty, staff and graduate students is appropriate	Meets	No major issues here.
Adequate library services, compute infrastructure and information infrastructure	Meets with Concerns	Meets with Concerns: NAS has a library. There is need to support a librarian at least half-time to maintain the current collection.
Laboratories (if appropriate) contain modern tools and equipment, are available, accessible, and systematically maintained and upgraded	NA	Not applicable because there are not laboratories in NAS.

8. PROGRAM COMPARISONS		
<p>Institutional support and leadership sufficient to assure quality and continuity of the program</p>	<p>Meets with Concerns</p>	<p>UNM needs to provide institutional support in order for the NAS program to develop as an academic program. Institutional support for tenure-track faculty positions is important. Strong support from the Provost and the Dean of the University College is key to this support. Leadership is at the foundation of the support. What is the commitment by the Provost and the Dean of the University College to take leadership in providing institutional support?</p>
<p>Institutional services, financial support, and staff adequate to meet program needs</p>	<p>Not Met</p>	<p>In order for the NAS program to continue to serve students who take their classes or are pursuing a major or minor in NAS, the University must provide funding for faculty lines (at least two). In addition, funds are needed to develop the library so the program can develop into a research center for local, state-wide, and national scholars and to serve as a center for Indigenous Nations.</p>
<p>Sufficient to attract and retain a well-qualified faculty and provide for their professional development</p>	<p>Meets with Concerns</p>	<p>The NAS program attracts attention from Native scholars across North America because of the geographic location of the university, geographic proximity to 22 Native Nations in New Mexico, and, more importantly, for the academic excellence of the program itself. However, with the limited budget for faculty lines and the economic support to build and sustain a graduate program in NAS, the program cannot realize its potential. As for salary, we were not provided with details on the salaries of NAS faculty as they compare to other institutions.</p>

<p>Sufficient to acquire, maintain, and operate infrastructure, facilities, and equipment</p>	<p>Meets with Concerns</p>	<p>The NAS program has operated with limited resources. The expectations by their students, Native Nations, and communities are met, but this is largely due to NAS faculty and staff working under challenging conditions.</p>
<p>Sufficient to provide an environment to attain student outcomes</p>	<p>Meets with Concerns</p>	<p>Overall, the NAS program are receiving a solid education. They are able to pursue graduate degrees and/or employment after graduation from UNM. Both students and faculty in NAS appear to be satisfied with the scope and sequence of the curriculum, the student learning objectives, the instructional strategies or pedagogical practices, and the assessments (formative and summative) employed in the classes. There is concern, however, that due to the absence of a graduate program in NAS they are forced to leave the state to attend universities in Oklahoma, Montana, and California (UCLA and UC Davis). Leaving the state for many of the Native students is also leaving their cultural responsibilities in the Navajo Nation, the nineteen Pueblo Nations, and the two Apache Nations. For some, leaving the state is not an option so they do not pursue graduate studies.</p>

9. FUTURE DIRECTION		
Unit engages in strategic planning	Meets	<p>The strategic plan demonstrates a clear understanding of short- and long-term goals. In addition to working with faculty across the campus to create a new college – College of Social Transformation – and working among themselves in retreats, the NAS program is developing a NAS Master’s Degree program. The plan for the graduate program is divided into three phases or years. Each year is comprised of over nine tasks. The first two phases or years consist of planning and securing support. The third phase or year is when the first students will enroll in the tribal MA program.</p>

<p>Unit make use of appropriate data, including peer comparisons, in strategic planning</p>	<p>Meets</p>	<p>The program for the LSIC Masters Emphasis falls into two broad categories: Leadership Education for Indigenous Self-Determination and Policy Analysis. The report provides a detailed explanation of each program that includes attention to distance learning, internships, tribal college programs, curriculum development, research, and funding. Attention to detail and careful planning of the two programs are the result of making use of appropriate data and peer comparisons. For peer comparisons, the writers of the report conducted careful research under the following categories: Department or College that the NAS or AIS program is situated, the degree offerings (major, minor, MA, Ph.D.), the programs or areas of concentration, and the number of faculty (joint and full). The data presented in this chart clearly demonstrates that the NAS program at UNM is above par for undergraduate degree programs. However, the absence of a graduate program at UNM places it below par when compared to five peer institutions that offer MA and Ph.D. programs.</p>
---	--------------	---

<p>Unit is aware of its strengths and weaknesses, and prioritizes its improvement activities accordingly</p>	<p>Meets with Concerns</p>	<p>Administration recognize the strengths of the NAS program as do the students. Most were aware of the strength in scholarship that is produced by NAS faculty. Students recognized the strength of the program for Indigenous Nations across the state and the nation. NAS faculty also acknowledge the importance of their scholarship, service, and teaching. At the same time, NAS faculty recognizes their challenges. The top challenge is human resource capacity followed by the need for economic support. They are aware of the need to gain more faculty and secure funding to build the MA program. Administrators are also aware of these challenges. The challenges are important to acknowledge and act upon.</p>
--	----------------------------	---

10. PROGRAM STRENGTHS

The review team is impressed with the overall NAS leadership provided by Dr. Gregory Cajete. Professor Cajete indicated a desire to increase the NAS profile on campus and documentation of how a NAS degree directly impacts the overall retention and graduation rates for Native American students at UNM, as well as connecting NAS majors to other university programs. He has provided stable leadership for NAS in an era of social turbulence especially within an unpredictable economy and volatile times at UNM during his tenure as Director. NAS has achieved national distinction at the bachelor's degree level as a solid academic program that provides new frameworks for clarifying postcolonial Indigenous thought. NAS faculty and staff are to be commended for their passionate dedication to providing a quality educational experience for their students despite lean institutional resources and faculty salary constraints. NAS faculty and staff are justifiably proud of their strong culturally responsive and relationship-based pedagogy and research with New Mexico sovereign tribes and local Albuquerque tribal community. NAS is highly attractive to regional Native students due to its faculty/staff's national academic reputation who otherwise would have great difficulty taking NAS courses outside the state of New Mexico.